

EXHIBIT "A"**M E M O**

To: **Ryan Cummins, P.E.**

From: Scott Wood, P.E.

Date: June 11, 2021

Project Number: 21181

Regarding: Nagel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project
Bid Results and Recommendation

Please find enclosed a Bid Tabulation for the bids received on June 10, 2021 for the Nagel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project. A total of (8) bids were submitted and opened at the City of Avon – City Hall. Bids ranged from a low bid of \$333,852.50 to a high bid of \$409,435.50.

The Engineers Estimate for the project was \$342,835. The low bid of \$333,852.50 as received from Barbicas Paving, LLC is approximately 2.6% below the Engineers Estimate for the project.

Summary of Bid Totals

Contractor	Bid Total
Barbicas Paving, LLC	\$333,852.50
Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$347,255.75
NES Corporation	\$348,060.00
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$361,942.50
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$371,725.00
Specialized Construction, Inc.	\$380,867.50
Kokosing Construction Company, Inc.	\$387,567.51
The Vallejo Company	\$409,435.50

The bid as submitted by Barbicas Paving, LLC has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with the requirements of the Contract Documents. Therefore, it is our recommendation to the City of Avon - City Council that Barbicas Paving, LLC is the lowest and best bid for the Nagel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project.

Cc: Michael Farmer, City of Avon, Service Director
Bill Logan, City of Avon, Finance Director
John Gasior, City of Avon, Law Director

BID TABULATION**Nagel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project****City of Avon****DATE: June 10, 2021**CVE JOB NO. 21181 Engineer's Estimate **\$342,835.00**

				Barbicas Paving, LLC		Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	EXCAVATION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	20	\$30.00	\$600.00	\$35.00	\$700.00
2	SUBGRADE COMPACTION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	SY	60	\$1.00	\$60.00	\$5.00	\$300.00
3	LINEAR GRADING	LF	3,945	\$1.00	\$3,945.00	\$1.35	\$5,325.75
4	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	900	\$20.00	\$18,000.00	\$32.00	\$28,800.00
5	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,000	\$48.00	\$48,000.00	\$45.00	\$45,000.00
6	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE	SY	7,215	\$2.50	\$18,037.50	\$2.00	\$14,430.00
7	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	15	\$250.00	\$3,750.00	\$245.00	\$3,675.00
8	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	140	\$70.00	\$9,800.00	\$65.00	\$9,100.00
9	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	405	\$205.00	\$83,025.00	\$190.00	\$76,950.00
10	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	155	\$205.00	\$31,775.00	\$165.00	\$25,575.00
11	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$800.00	\$1,600.00	\$800.00	\$1,600.00
12	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$450.00	\$900.00
13	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.50	\$1,500.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
14	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$22,500.00	\$22,500.00
15	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	CY	10	\$150.00	\$1,500.00	\$225.00	\$2,250.00
16	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	880	\$2.00	\$1,760.00	\$3.00	\$2,640.00
17	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	150	\$60.00	\$9,000.00	\$77.00	\$11,550.00
18	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$450.00	\$450.00
19	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$17,000.00	\$17,000.00	\$23,425.00	\$23,425.00
20	PAVEMENT MARKINGS	LUMP	1	\$13,500.00	\$13,500.00	\$13,500.00	\$13,500.00
21	TOPSOIL	CY	365	\$40.00	\$14,600.00	\$60.00	\$21,900.00
22	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	1	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$185.00	\$185.00
23	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00
24	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$333,852.50	TOTAL	\$347,255.75
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60	
				EARLIEST START DATE: 8/2/2021		EARLIEST START DATE: 8/1/2021	

				N.E.S Corp.		Chagrin Valley Paving Inc.	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	EXCAVATION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	20	\$80.00	\$1,600.00	\$50.00	\$1,000.00
2	SUBGRADE COMPACTION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	SY	60	\$6.00	\$360.00	\$1.00	\$60.00
3	LINEAR GRADING	LF	3,945	\$4.00	\$15,780.00	\$0.50	\$1,972.50
4	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	900	\$30.00	\$27,000.00	\$15.00	\$13,500.00
5	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,000	\$50.00	\$50,000.00	\$35.00	\$35,000.00
6	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE	SY	7,215	\$3.00	\$21,645.00	\$2.00	\$14,430.00
7	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	15	\$215.00	\$3,225.00	\$250.00	\$3,750.00
8	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	140	\$50.00	\$7,000.00	\$50.00	\$7,000.00
9	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	405	\$160.00	\$64,800.00	\$235.00	\$95,175.00
10	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	155	\$180.00	\$27,900.00	\$235.00	\$36,425.00
11	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$850.00	\$1,700.00	\$750.00	\$1,500.00
12	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00
13	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$2.00	\$2,000.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
14	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$45,000.00	\$45,000.00
15	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	CY	10	\$300.00	\$3,000.00	\$250.00	\$2,500.00
16	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	880	\$5.00	\$4,400.00	\$1.00	\$880.00
17	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	150	\$70.00	\$10,500.00	\$50.00	\$7,500.00
18	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$600.00	\$600.00
19	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$18,000.00	\$18,000.00	\$39,000.00	\$39,000.00
20	PAVEMENT MARKINGS	LUMP	1	\$13,000.00	\$13,000.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00
21	TOPSOIL	CY	365	\$50.00	\$18,250.00	\$30.00	\$10,950.00
22	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	1	\$400.00	\$400.00	\$500.00	\$500.00
23	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00
24	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$348,060.00	TOTAL	\$361,942.50
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 10/15/21	
				EARLIEST START DATE: 7/28/2021		EARLIEST START DATE: 9/7/2021	

*Error in total on contract

				Ronyak Paving Inc.		Specialized Construction Inc.	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	EXCAVATION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	20	\$40.00	\$800.00	\$50.00	\$1,000.00
2	SUBGRADE COMPACTION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	SY	60	\$0.50	\$30.00	\$2.00	\$120.00
3	LINEAR GRADING	LF	3,945	\$1.00	\$3,945.00	\$2.00	\$7,890.00
4	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	900	\$24.00	\$21,600.00	\$35.00	\$31,500.00
5	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,000	\$48.00	\$48,000.00	\$65.00	\$65,000.00
6	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE	SY	7,215	\$3.00	\$21,645.00	\$3.50	\$25,252.50
7	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	15	\$360.00	\$5,400.00	\$220.00	\$3,300.00
8	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	140	\$75.00	\$10,500.00	\$50.00	\$7,000.00
9	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	405	\$185.00	\$74,925.00	\$185.00	\$74,925.00
10	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	155	\$210.00	\$32,550.00	\$175.00	\$27,125.00
11	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$635.00	\$1,270.00	\$900.00	\$1,800.00
12	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$370.00	\$740.00	\$575.00	\$1,150.00
13	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.75	\$1,750.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
14	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$28,265.00	\$28,265.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
15	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	CY	10	\$110.00	\$1,100.00	\$40.00	\$400.00
16	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	880	\$8.50	\$7,480.00	\$6.00	\$5,280.00
17	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	150	\$95.00	\$14,250.00	\$100.00	\$15,000.00
18	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$515.00	\$515.00	\$575.00	\$575.00
19	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$16,500.00	\$16,500.00	\$17,000.00	\$17,000.00
20	PAVEMENT MARKINGS	LUMP	1	\$7,300.00	\$7,300.00	\$13,000.00	\$13,000.00
21	TOPSOIL	CY	365	\$104.00	\$37,960.00	\$60.00	\$21,900.00
22	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	1	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$150.00	\$150.00
23	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00
24	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$371,725.00	TOTAL	\$380,867.50
NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60						NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60	
EARLIEST START DATE: 9/13/2021						EARLIEST START DATE: 8/1/2021	

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	Kokosing Construction Company, Inc.		The Vallejo Company	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	EXCAVATION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	20	\$68.65	\$1,373.00	\$35.00	\$700.00
2	SUBGRADE COMPACTION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	SY	60	\$1.25	\$75.00	\$0.50	\$30.00
3	LINEAR GRADING	LF	3,945	\$0.90	\$3,550.50	\$5.00	\$19,725.00
4	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	900	\$27.00	\$24,300.00	\$35.00	\$31,500.00
5	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,000	\$55.00	\$55,000.00	\$58.00	\$58,000.00
6	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE	SY	7,215	\$2.30	\$16,594.50	\$2.70	\$19,480.50
7	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	15	\$300.00	\$4,500.00	\$150.00	\$2,250.00
8	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	140	\$73.15	\$10,241.00	\$75.00	\$10,500.00
9	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	405	\$197.00	\$79,785.00	\$200.00	\$81,000.00
10	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	155	\$187.00	\$28,985.00	\$180.00	\$27,900.00
11	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$634.95	\$1,269.90	\$1,050.00	\$2,100.00
12	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$369.95	\$739.90	\$550.00	\$1,100.00
13	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.60	\$1,600.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
14	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$29,756.16	\$29,756.16	\$29,000.00	\$29,000.00
15	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	CY	10	\$546.06	\$5,460.60	\$100.00	\$1,000.00
16	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	880	\$11.00	\$9,680.00	\$10.00	\$8,800.00
17	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	150	\$90.79	\$13,618.50	\$75.00	\$11,250.00
18	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$514.95	\$514.95	\$600.00	\$600.00
19	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$13,000.00	\$13,000.00	\$11,000.00	\$11,000.00
20	PAVEMENT MARKINGS	LUMP	1	\$12,600.00	\$12,600.00	\$35,000.00	\$35,000.00
21	TOPSOIL	CY	365	\$103.90	\$37,923.50	\$60.00	\$21,900.00
22	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	1	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$100.00	\$100.00
23	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00
24	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$387,567.51	TOTAL	\$409,435.50
NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60						NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 30-60	
EARLIEST START DATE: 8/31/2021						EARLIEST START DATE: 8/1/2021	

BIDDER'S CHECKLIST

Nagel Road Pavement Resurfacing Project (3 Low Bidders)

Bid Opening Date – June 10, 2021

Avon, Ohio

Bid Components	Barbicas Paving, LLC	Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc	NES Corporation
Proposal - Completed and Signed	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bid Bond or Check - Submitted with Bid	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond
Bidder's Qualification Statement – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Personal Property Tax Statement – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Non-Collusion Affidavit – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Certifications for Finding of Recovery – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Verification of Bid Total	Yes	Yes	Yes