



M E M O

To: **Ryan Cummins, P.E.**

From: Scott Wood, P.E.

Date: May 14, 2021

Project Number: 21138

Regarding: Jaycox Road Pavement Resurfacing Project
(Chester Road to NS Railroad Crossing)
Bid Results and Recommendation

Please find enclosed a Bid Tabulation for the bids received on May 13, 2021 for the Jaycox Road Pavement Resurfacing Project. A total of (5) bids were submitted and opened at the City of Avon – City Hall. Bids ranged from a low bid of \$437,551.00 to a high bid of \$500,698.00.

The Engineer's Estimate for the project was \$557,940. The low bid of \$437,551.00 as received from Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. is approximately 21.5% below the Engineer's Estimate for the project.

Summary of Bid Totals

Contractor	Bid Total
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$437,551.00
Barbicas Construction Company, Inc.	\$457,298.00
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$475,334.05
Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$478,724.50
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$500,698.00

The bid as submitted by Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with the requirements of the Contract Documents. Therefore, it is our recommendation to the City of Avon - City Council that Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. is the lowest and best bid for the Jaycox Road Pavement Resurfacing Project.

Cc: Michael Farmer, City of Avon, Service Director
Bill Logan, City of Avon, Finance Director
John Gasior, City of Avon, Law Director

BID TABULATION

Jaycox Road Resurfacing - North
City of Avon

DATE: May 13, 2021

CVE JOB NO. 21138 Engineer's Estimate \$557,940.00

				Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.		Barbicas Paving, LLC	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	65	\$50.00	\$3,250.00	\$65.00	\$4,225.00
2	EXCAVATION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	25	\$50.00	\$1,250.00	\$33.00	\$825.00
3	SUBGRADE COMPACTION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	SY	75	\$1.00	\$75.00	\$3.00	\$225.00
4	LINEAR GRADING	LF	6,112	\$0.50	\$3,056.00	\$4.00	\$24,448.00
5	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	990	\$16.00	\$15,840.00	\$20.00	\$19,800.00
6	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,870	\$37.00	\$69,190.00	\$37.00	\$69,190.00
7	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	9,915	\$2.00	\$19,830.00	\$3.00	\$29,745.00
8	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	15	\$300.00	\$4,500.00	\$175.00	\$2,625.00
9	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	325	\$40.00	\$13,000.00	\$40.00	\$13,000.00
10	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	555	\$170.00	\$94,350.00	\$200.00	\$111,000.00
11	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	210	\$170.00	\$35,700.00	\$200.00	\$42,000.00
12	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	3	\$750.00	\$2,250.00	\$625.00	\$1,875.00
13	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$600.00	\$3,000.00	\$100.00	\$500.00
14	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.50	\$1,500.00	\$1.26	\$1,260.00
15	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFICE	LUMP	1	\$45,000.00	\$45,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00
16	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFICE	CY	10	\$250.00	\$2,500.00	\$150.00	\$1,500.00
17	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,360	\$1.00	\$1,360.00	\$3.00	\$4,080.00
18	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	230	\$50.00	\$11,500.00	\$63.00	\$14,490.00
19	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$600.00	\$600.00	\$110.00	\$110.00
20	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$35,450.00	\$35,450.00	\$19,500.00	\$19,500.00
21	REMOVE & REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$3,300.00	\$3,300.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00
22	PAVEMENT MARKINGS	LUMP	1	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00
23	TOPSOIL	CY	285	\$30.00	\$8,550.00	\$40.00	\$11,400.00
24	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00
25	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$437,551.00	TOTAL	\$457,298.00
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: By 9/30/2021		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60	
				EARLIEST START DATE: 7/1/2021		EARLIEST START DATE: 7/1/2021	

				Karvo Companies, Inc.		Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	65	\$110.00	\$7,150.00	\$115.00	\$7,475.00
2	EXCAVATION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	25	\$50.00	\$1,250.00	\$32.00	\$800.00
3	SUBGRADE COMPACTION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	SY	75	\$1.25	\$93.75	\$3.00	\$225.00
4	LINEAR GRADING	LF	6,112	\$1.20	\$7,334.40	\$3.00	\$18,336.00
5	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	990	\$22.21	\$21,987.90	\$35.00	\$34,650.00
6	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,870	\$55.00	\$102,850.00	\$42.00	\$78,540.00
7	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	9,915	\$2.00	\$19,830.00	\$2.50	\$24,787.50
8	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	15	\$225.00	\$3,375.00	\$225.00	\$3,375.00
9	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	325	\$60.00	\$19,500.00	\$60.00	\$19,500.00
10	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	555	\$175.00	\$97,125.00	\$185.00	\$102,675.00
11	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	210	\$157.00	\$32,970.00	\$180.00	\$37,800.00
12	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	3	\$950.00	\$2,850.00	\$1,000.00	\$3,000.00
13	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$350.00	\$1,750.00	\$500.00	\$2,500.00
14	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.75	\$1,750.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
15	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFICE	LUMP	1	\$46,500.00	\$46,500.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
16	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFICE	CY	10	\$200.00	\$2,000.00	\$200.00	\$2,000.00
17	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,360	\$4.55	\$6,188.00	\$0.60	\$816.00
18	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	230	\$60.00	\$13,800.00	\$80.00	\$18,400.00
19	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$650.00	\$650.00
20	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$29,070.00	\$29,070.00
21	REMOVE & REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00
22	PAVEMENT MARKINGS	LUMP	1	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00
23	TOPSOIL	CY	285	\$38.00	\$10,830.00	\$25.00	\$7,125.00
24	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00
25	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$475,334.05	TOTAL	\$478,724.50
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: By 9/30/2021		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60	
				EARLIEST START DATE: 6/1/2021		EARLIEST START DATE: 7/1/2021	

				Ronyak Paving, Inc.	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	65	\$65.00	\$4,225.00
2	EXCAVATION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	25	\$65.00	\$1,625.00
3	SUBGRADE COMPACTION (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	SY	75	\$4.00	\$300.00
4	LINEAR GRADING	LF	6,112	\$4.00	\$24,448.00
5	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	990	\$25.00	\$24,750.00 *
6	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,870	\$50.00	\$93,500.00
7	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	9,915	\$2.00	\$19,830.00
8	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE (AGGREGATE DRIVEWAYS)	CY	15	\$370.00	\$5,550.00
9	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	325	\$60.00	\$19,500.00
10	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	555	\$170.00	\$94,350.00
11	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	210	\$185.00	\$38,850.00
12	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	3	\$700.00	\$2,100.00
13	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$550.00	\$2,750.00
14	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.55	\$1,550.00
15	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFICE	LUMP	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
16	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFICE	CY	10	\$255.00	\$2,550.00
17	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,360	\$7.00	\$9,520.00
18	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	230	\$90.00	\$20,700.00
19	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$550.00	\$550.00
20	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00
21	REMOVE & REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$3,300.00	\$3,300.00
22	PAVEMENT MARKINGS	LUMP	1	\$6,500.00	\$6,500.00
23	TOPSOIL	CY	285	\$50.00	\$14,250.00
24	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00
25	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$500,698.00 *
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45	
				EARLIEST START DATE: 7/5/2021	
				* Math error	

BIDDER'S CHECKLIST

Jaycox Road Pavement Resurfacing Project (Chester Road to NS Railroad Crossing)

(3 Low Bidders)

Bid Opening Date – May 13, 2021

Avon, Ohio

Bid Components	Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	Barbicas Construction Company, Inc.	Karvo Companies, Inc.
Proposal - Completed and Signed	Yes	Yes	Yes
Clarification No. 1 – Submitted with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bid Bond or Check - Submitted with Bid	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond
Bidder's Qualification Statement – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Personal Property Tax Statement – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Non-Collusion Affidavit – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Certifications for Finding of Recovery – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Verification of Bid Total	Yes	Yes	Yes