



MEMO

To: **Ryan Cummins, P.E.**

From: Scott Wood, P.E.

Date: February 5, 2021

Project Number: 20334

Regarding: Moon Road Pavement Resurfacing Project
Bid Results and Recommendation

Please find enclosed a Bid Tabulation for the bids received on February 4, 2021 for the Moon Road Pavement Resurfacing Project. A total of (8) bids were submitted and opened at the City of Avon – City Hall. Bids ranged from a low bid of \$453,707.50 to a high bid of \$574,672.50.

The Engineers Estimate for the project was \$599,395. The low bid of \$453,707.50 as received from Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. is approximately 24% below the Engineers Estimate for the project.

Summary of Bid Totals

Contractor	Bid Total
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$453,707.50
Barbicas Construction Company, Inc.	\$454,093.75
Erie Blacktop, Inc.	\$470,656.15
Crossroads Asphalt	\$475,798.25
NES Corp	\$479,186.50
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$505,960.00
Karvo Companies, Inc.	\$508,462.50
Specialized Construction, Inc.	\$574,672.50

The bid as submitted by Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with the requirements of the Contract Documents. Therefore, it is our recommendation to the City of Avon - City Council that Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. is the lowest and best bid for the Moon Road Pavement Resurfacing Project.

Cc: Michael Farmer, City of Avon, Service Director
Bill Logan, City of Avon, Finance Director
John Gasior, City of Avon, Law Director

BID TABULATION**Moon Rd Pavement Resurfacing Project****City of Avon****DATE: February 4, 2021****CVE JOB NO. 20334 Engineer's Estimate \$599,395.00**

				Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.		Barbicas Construction Co., Inc.	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	CONCRETE DRIVE/PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	125	\$50.00	\$6,250.00	\$60.00	\$7,500.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REMOVAL AND CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REPLACEMENT	SY	250	\$70.00	\$17,500.00	\$70.00	\$17,500.00
3	CONCRETE CURB AND CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT	SY	100	\$92.00	\$9,200.00	\$80.00	\$8,000.00
4	EXCAVATION	CY	15	\$50.00	\$750.00	\$50.00	\$750.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	170	\$1.00	\$170.00	\$1.50	\$255.00
6	LINEAR GRADING, AS PER PLAN	LF	7,995	\$0.50	\$3,997.50	\$1.75	\$13,991.25
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,155	\$18.00	\$20,790.00	\$20.00	\$23,100.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,155	\$40.00	\$46,200.00	\$40.00	\$46,200.00
9	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	11,560	\$2.00	\$23,120.00	\$2.00	\$23,120.00
10	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	195	\$50.00	\$9,750.00	\$45.00	\$8,775.00
11	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	660	\$170.00	\$112,200.00	\$165.00	\$108,900.00
12	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	250	\$170.00	\$42,500.00	\$200.00	\$50,000.00
13	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	3	\$700.00	\$2,100.00	\$750.00	\$2,250.00
14	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$250.00	\$1,250.00	\$350.00	\$1,750.00
15	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.50	\$1,500.00	\$1.10	\$1,100.00
16	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00
17	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	CY	10	\$250.00	\$2,500.00	\$180.00	\$1,800.00
18	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,780	\$1.00	\$1,780.00	\$0.50	\$890.00
19	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	300	\$50.00	\$15,000.00	\$50.00	\$15,000.00
20	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	7	\$300.00	\$2,100.00	\$400.00	\$2,800.00
21	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$29,750.00	\$29,750.00	\$22,112.50	\$22,112.50
22	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$5,300.00	\$5,300.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00
23	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	32	\$125.00	\$4,000.00	\$150.00	\$4,800.00
24	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00
25	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$453,707.50	TOTAL	\$454,093.75
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 65		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 5/10/2021		EARLIEST START DATE: 4/26/2021	

Erie Blacktop Inc.				Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.			
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	CONCRETE DRIVE/PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	125	\$125.00	\$15,625.00	\$90.00	\$11,250.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REMOVAL AND CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REPLACEMENT	SY	250	\$78.00	\$19,500.00	\$70.00	\$17,500.00
3	CONCRETE CURB AND CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT	SY	100	\$112.00	\$11,200.00	\$92.00	\$9,200.00
4	EXCAVATION	CY	15	\$18.00	\$270.00	\$50.00	\$750.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	170	\$1.05	\$178.50	\$5.00	\$850.00
6	LINEAR GRADING, AS PER PLAN	LF	7,995	\$2.75	\$21,986.25	\$1.15	\$9,194.25
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,155	\$15.00	\$17,325.00	\$27.00	\$31,185.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,155	\$38.00	\$43,890.00	\$45.00	\$51,975.00
9	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	11,580	\$1.60	\$18,496.00	\$2.65	\$30,634.00
10	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	195	\$55.00	\$10,725.00	\$50.00	\$9,750.00
11	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	660	\$162.00	\$106,920.00	\$165.00	\$108,900.00
12	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	250	\$162.00	\$40,500.00	\$185.00	\$46,250.00
13	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	3	\$850.00	\$2,550.00	\$700.00	\$2,100.00
14	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$700.00	\$3,500.00	\$250.00	\$1,250.00
15	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$2.50	\$2,500.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
16	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$35,000.00	\$35,000.00	\$30,965.00	\$30,965.00
17	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	CY	10	\$350.00	\$3,500.00	\$200.00	\$2,000.00
18	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,780	\$5.00	\$8,900.00	\$1.50	\$2,670.00
19	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	300	\$55.00	\$16,500.00	\$60.00	\$18,000.00
20	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	7	\$700.00	\$4,900.00	\$300.00	\$2,100.00
21	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$18,500.00	\$18,500.00	\$19,975.00	\$19,975.00
22	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$6,200.00	\$6,200.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00
23	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	32	\$187.20	\$5,990.40	\$150.00	\$4,800.00
24	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00
25	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
	TOTAL PROJECT COST			TOTAL	\$470,656.15	TOTAL	\$475,798.25
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 30		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 6/1/2021		EARLIEST START DATE: 4/15/2021	

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	N.E.S. Corp			Ronyak Paving Inc.		
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	CONCRETE DRIVE/PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	125	\$100.00	\$12,500.00	\$140.00	\$17,500.00		
2	CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REMOVAL AND CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REPLACEMENT	SY	250	\$87.75	\$21,937.50	\$98.00	\$24,500.00		
3	CONCRETE CURB AND CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT	SY	100	\$130.00	\$13,000.00	\$190.00	\$19,000.00		
4	EXCAVATION	CY	15	\$60.00	\$900.00	\$35.00	\$525.00		
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	170	\$2.00	\$340.00	\$0.75	\$127.50		
6	LINEAR GRADING, AS PER PLAN	LF	7,995	\$3.00	\$23,985.00	\$1.00	\$7,995.00		
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,455	\$14.00	\$16,170.00	\$18.00	\$20,790.00		
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,455	\$24.00	\$27,720.00	\$50.00	\$57,750.00		
9	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	11,560	\$2.90	\$33,524.00	\$2.00	\$23,120.00		
10	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	195	\$40.00	\$7,800.00	\$45.00	\$8,775.00		
11	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	660	\$186.00	\$122,760.00	\$160.00	\$105,600.00		
12	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	250	\$174.00	\$43,500.00	\$175.00	\$43,750.00		
13	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	3	\$550.00	\$1,650.00	\$700.00	\$2,100.00		
14	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$350.00	\$1,750.00	\$550.00	\$2,750.00		
15	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.55	\$1,550.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00		
16	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$26,000.00	\$26,000.00	\$45,000.00	\$45,000.00		
17	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	CY	10	\$50.00	\$500.00	\$255.00	\$2,550.00		
18	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,780	\$5.00	\$8,900.00	\$5.00	\$8,900.00		
19	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	300	\$40.00	\$12,000.00	\$76.00	\$22,800.00		
20	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	7	\$400.00	\$2,800.00	\$550.00	\$3,850.00		
21	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$27,000.00	\$27,000.00	\$19,837.50	\$19,837.50		
22	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$10,500.00	\$10,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00		
23	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	32	\$200.00	\$6,400.00	\$195.00	\$6,240.00		
24	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00		
25	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00		
	TOTAL PROJECT COST			TOTAL	\$479,186.50	TOTAL	\$505,960.00		
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 90		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 75			
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 4/15/2021		EARLIEST START DATE: 4/15/2021			

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	Karvo Companies, Inc.		Specialized Construction Incorporated	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	CONCRETE DRIVE/PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	125	\$75.00	\$9,375.00	\$65.00	\$8,125.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REMOVAL AND CONCRETE DRIVEWAY REPLACEMENT	SY	250	\$88.00	\$22,000.00	\$75.00	\$18,750.00
3	CONCRETE CURB AND CONCRETE PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND REPLACEMENT	SY	100	\$130.00	\$13,000.00	\$95.00	\$9,500.00
4	EXCAVATION	CY	15	\$115.00	\$1,725.00	\$50.00	\$750.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	170	\$1.85	\$314.50	\$1.00	\$170.00
6	LINEAR GRADING, AS PER PLAN	LF	7,995	\$5.80	\$46,371.00	\$8.50	\$67,957.50
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,155	\$28.00	\$32,340.00	\$20.00	\$23,100.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	1,155	\$42.00	\$48,510.00	\$40.00	\$46,200.00
9	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	11,560	\$1.95	\$22,542.00	\$4.00	\$46,240.00
10	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	195	\$50.00	\$9,750.00	\$40.00	\$7,800.00
11	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	660	\$150.00	\$99,000.00	\$200.00	\$132,000.00
12	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	250	\$138.00	\$34,500.00	\$180.00	\$45,000.00
13	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	3	\$550.00	\$1,650.00	\$900.00	\$2,700.00
14	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$350.00	\$1,750.00	\$40.00	\$200.00
15	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.65	\$1,650.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
16	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$43,000.00	\$43,000.00	\$35,000.00	\$35,000.00
17	ASPHALT PAVEMENT FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	CY	10	\$215.00	\$2,150.00	\$100.00	\$1,000.00
18	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,780	\$9.75	\$17,355.00	\$8.00	\$14,240.00
19	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	300	\$82.00	\$24,600.00	\$80.00	\$24,000.00
20	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	7	\$400.00	\$2,800.00	\$40.00	\$280.00
21	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
22	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$5,300.00	\$5,300.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
23	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	32	\$165.00	\$5,280.00	\$130.00	\$4,160.00
24	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00	\$51,000.00
25	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
	TOTAL PROJECT COST			TOTAL	\$508,462.50	TOTAL	\$574,672.50
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 91		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 4/15/2021		EARLIEST START DATE: 5/1/2021	

BIDDER'S CHECKLIST

Moon Road Pavement Resurfacing Project (3 Low Bidders)

Bid Opening Date – February 4, 2021

Avon, Ohio

Bid Components	Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	Barbicas Construction Company, Inc.	Erie Blacktop, Inc.
Proposal - Completed and Signed	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bid Bond or Check - Submitted with Bid	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond
Bidder's Qualification Statement – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Personal Property Tax Statement – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Non-Collusion Affidavit – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Certifications for Finding of Recovery – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Verification of Bid Total	Yes	Yes	Yes